Introduction

Considerable scientific evidence has been published in recent years (1-17) to show that in the treatment of malignant and benign thyroid nodular pathologies, total thyroidectomy (TT) is, in principle, more effective than near total thyroidectomy (NTT) or subtotal thyroidectomy (ST) in terms of:

- Resolution of the thyroid pathology
- Avoidance of recurrences
- Improved response to lifelong substitutive organotherapy
- Negligible rate of recurrence

Near Total Thyroidectomy (NTT) is associated with a low rate of recurrence. Subtotal Thyroidectomy (ST), in which a portion of the thyroid gland is deliberately left in the thyroid lodge, has a considerably higher rate of recurrence. The incidence of complications with TT is similar to that with other techniques of thyroid exeresis. However, despite the radical intent of surgeons, a real TT is not always carried out. The complete removal of all the thyroid tissue employing TT is not the norm and micro/macroscopic remnants almost always remain. The literature on these tissue remnants is often based on techniques that are not very accurate in terms of determining the diameters of the tissue remaining. In our study, conducted by colour echo-doppler of the thyroid tissue residues after TT in 102 patients who had undergone TT for benign thyroid pathologies, we demonstrated significant thyroid tissue remnants after TT in 34 cases of 102 (33.3%).

Therefore, out of a total of 102 so-called “total thyroidectomies”, only 68 (66.7%) were really total, whereas 12 patients (11.7%) had near total thyroidectomy, leaving tissue remnants < 1 cm, and 22 patients (21.57%) had subtotal thyroidectomy, with tissue remnants ≥ 1 cm.

KEY WORDS: Thyroid - Total thyroidectomy - Residues.
- curing thyroid disease,
- avoiding recurrences,
- providing a better response to life-long substitutive organotherapy,
- allowing the use of thyreoglobulin (Tg) as a marker of recurrence or metastasis,
- allowing the use of radioiodine successively for diagnosis and therapy of any functioning neoplastic recurrences found.

Neoplastic thyreocytes maintain the capacity to fix radioactive iodine under thyreotropic stimulation; this capacity, however, is considerably lower than that of normal thyroid cells (50-100 times less). Adjuvant metabolic radioiodine therapy is possible, therefore, only after the complete ablation of all the thyroid gland parenchyma. This total removal allows for the detection of any local or regional neoplastic recurrences or distal metastases and leads to a substantial improvement in disease progression through the use of radioisotope therapy (18).

TT is defined as the complete removal of visible thyroid tissue in the neck and has a negligible rate of recurrence. Similarly, NTT, which leaves <1 cm of residual parenchyma, often behind the recurrent laryngeal nerve (RLN) near Berry's ligament, is associated with a low rate of recurrence. On the contrary, ST, in which a portion of the thyroid gland is deliberately left in the thyroid lodge, has a considerably higher rate of recurrence (15).

Differentiated carcinoma of the thyroid is characterised by disease progression with a low mortality rate; however, recurrences can appear even years after surgical treatment and therefore long-term clinical monitoring protocols are required (18).

After surgery, attentive monitoring of patients with thyroid cancer is essential in order to detect local or regional recurrences and to ensure that there are no distal metastases (17). According to recently published European and American guidelines, in the treatment of patients with differentiated thyroid cancer, ultrasound of the neck to evaluate the thyroid lodge and the lymphonode compartments of the neck is recommended at 6 to 12 months and then annually for at least 3 to 5 years, depending on the patient’s risk category (1, 2, 17).

The main objectives of the follow-up are the:
- early identification of any signs of disease persistence,
- identification, in the first stage, of recurrences or metastases,
- monitoring of suppressive doses of levothyroxine.

Careful surveillance in order to identify any recurrences in apparently disease-free patients is the primary objective of long term follow-up. Postoperative evaluations include an objective examination of the neck, thyroid and laterocervical colour echo-Doppler, X-ray of the thorax to show any lung metastases, iodine-131 whole body scanning (WBS), tumor markers such as thyreoglobulin (Tg) for carcinomas of thyreocyte genesis, and calcitonin for medullary thyroid carcinoma (17).

The recurrence of papillary carcinoma in the thyroid lodge, particularly in elderly patients with extrathyroid pathology, is associated with a significant increase in the mortality rate related to cancer (17, 19, 20). Early detection of local/regional recurrences, in patients with invasive pathology is essential to achieve improved therapeutic surgical results or metabolic radiotherapy success (17).

Regarding lesions situated in the thyroid lodge of patients who had previously undergone thyroidectomy, the distinction between thyroid cancer recurrence, benign recurrence and thyroid remnants is not always straightforward based solely on ultrasound results, due to the lack of specific diagnostic criteria.

Cytopathologic examination of fine-needle aspiration samples or surgical excision of suspect nodes is sometimes necessary to determine the histological nature of such lesions (17).

We carried out colour echo-doppler examinations of the thyroid lodge in 102 TT patients to demonstrate that TT does not always correspond with the complete removal of the thyroid gland and that a significant number of TT cases should be declassified into NTT or ST.

**Patients and methods**

A retrospective analysis of patient database of the Department of Radiological Sciences was conducted to identify all the patients who had undergone total thyroidectomy for benign thyroid pathologies.

During the follow-up, at intervals of 6-12 months, all the patients were first prescribed: - thyroid hormones, in their free fraction (FT3, FT4); TSH (thyroid-stimulating hormone); thyreoglobulin and/or antithyreoglobulin antibodies during suppressive and/or substitutive hormonal therapy; colour echo-Doppler of the neck and, in the case of doubtful ultrasound results, scintigraphy.

Ultrasound of the neck is recommended to evaluate the thyroid lodge and the lymphonode compartments at 6 and 12 months, and then yearly for a period of time that depends on the risk category of the patient. All the patients in this study underwent an ultrasound of the neck within a year of surgery. A Technos MPX, Esaote, Genova, Toshiba Apio VX, Osaka, Japan, equipped with a high frequency linear probe (7.5-13 MHZ) was used. The examination was conducted by an expert operator to detect the presence of any residual thyroid tissue and/or other neck pathologies. When residual thyroid tissue was found, at least two diameters were measured and ultrasound and vascularization evaluations were carried out.

A total of 102 patients were selected who had undergone ultrasound examination of the neck during follow-up after total thyroidectomies carried out at different Hospitals for benign thyroid pathologies from January 2004 to December 2007, 12 males and 90 females (ratio M/F = 1/7.5), mean age 57 years (range 18–81 years).
Results

Thyroid gland remnants were found in 33.3% of the total cases examined (34/102); of these, 32 patients were female and 2 were male (M/F = 1/16); the mean age was 56.9 years (range 34–79 years). Therefore, there were no significant differences in terms of age or sex. The mean maximum diameter of the gland remnants observed in the thyroid lodge was 10.58 mm (range 4–30 mm).

Of these 34 cases, 22 (64.7%) showed a maximum diameter of tissue remnants of ≥ 1 cm, while in 12 cases (35.3%), the maximum diameter of gland parenchyma was < 1 cm.

Therefore, out of a total of 102 TTs, only 68 (66.7%) were effectively total, whereas 34 (33.3%) were shown to be less than total; specifically 12 patients of 102 (11.76%), who instead of having undergone a TT, had had an NTT, leaving parenchyma remnants < 1 cm; while 22 (21.57%) patients really underwent an ST, with tissue remnants ≥ 1 cm.

In 10 of the 34 cases (29.4%) the thyroid parenchyma remnants were found to be bilateral in the thyroid lodge, while in 24 cases (70.6%) it was unilateral. Of the latter, 9 cases (37.5%) were on the right and 15 cases (62.5%) on the left.

Discussion

TT has numerous advantages over less radical approaches, such as the resolution of the thyroid pathology, avoidance of recurrences, and improved response to life-long substitutive organotherapy. TT allows the use of thyroglobulin (Tg) as a marker of recurrences and metastases, and also the subsequent use radioiodine for diagnosis and treatment of functioning metastases. Despite the fact that TT as the initial treatment remains controversial, it is nonetheless recommended for the treatment of the majority of patients with benign or malignant thyroid pathologies (1, 2, 16).

Although papillary carcinoma has a disease progression that is not highly aggressive and the mortality rate is not high, recurrences can occur even many years after surgical treatment (18-21). Recurrence of papillary carcinoma in the thyroid lodge, particularly in elderly patients with extrathyroid pathologies, carries a significantly increased risk of mortality (17, 22, 23). Early diagnosis of local/regional recurrences in patients with invasive diseases is, therefore, important to achieving greater surgical therapeutic success and/or more effective radio-metabolic treatment. Thus, long-term monitoring protocols are essential with such patients (18).

The extension of TT to benign thyroid pathologies is still a matter of discussion. The object of surgical treatment is to ensure the best therapeutic treatment with the lowest possible risk of complications and to avoid the need to reoperate the neck. TT is the treatment of choice when the thyroid pathology involves both lobes and if there is a high risk of recurrence, as in multinodular benign goitre, Flaiani-Graves-Basedow disease and cancer (6, 24, 25). Some surgeons maintain that the morbidity of non-total operations is lower than TT (24, 26, 27); therefore, they generally prefer ST for benign pathologies. In agreement with certain authors, TT may be preferable in order to achieve the complete eradication of the disease and to prevent recurrences, to facilitate radioiodine treatment and to eliminate the risk that the irradiated thyroid can degenerate into a malignant state (24, 28). Arguments against this strategy are based on a higher rate of complications, in particular, lesion of the recurrent nerve and hypoparathyroidism and the need for life-long substitutive organotherapy (24, 29-31).

The efficacy of suppressive treatment with L-tiroxina is still controversial (24, 32-36); substitutive organotherapy in TT patients can be considered as a dependence, but more than half of the patients who undergo Dunhill Procedure (DP) or ST need to take L-tiroxina (24). DP is a technique of thyroid removal first carried out at the beginning of the last century by Sir Thomas P. Dunhill (1876-1957), who used the procedure for toxic goitre. This procedure consists in the removal of a lobe, the isthmus and from half to two thirds of the contralateral lobe (24, 37). The term DP was used with reference to treating Graves’ disease by certain authors (24, 38, 39).

It has been suggested that TT is a gold standard for diffuse bilateral pathologies and malign pathologies of the thyroid. Another factor in favour of TT is the risk of cancer onset or recurrence in residual thyroid tissue after NTT (40). The incidence of complications with TT is similar to that with other techniques of thyroid exeresis, thus, TT could be adopted for surgical treatment also in cases of benign thyroid pathology. In addition, reoperation of the neck carries a higher risk of morbidity; therefore, the authors consider TT to be the treatment of choice, despite the need for life-long substitutive organotherapy (24).

TT has a low risk of local/regional recurrence and facilitates detection of metastases both through serum Tg assessment and through 131I WBS (13, 14, 16). Furthermore, TT can improve survival in high-risk patients without increasing surgical morbidity, if carried out expertly (41).

Some authors carry out TT from one side and ST from the other for benign thyroid pathologies such as Graves’ disease and nodular goitre (24, 26, 27). It has been observed that TT is indicated for Graves’ disease.
and that it is as safe as ST (24, 26, 39); Koyuncu et al. (24) performed TT also for other benign thyroid diseases (24).

Pappalardo et al. (42) compared TT and DP during a long-term follow-up period, and they saw recurrences in 10 (14%) of 72 patients operated on with ST (24). Koyuncu et al. (24) compared different techniques of thyroid removal: TT, ST, and DP. The rate of paraesthesia of the RLN with TT compared with ST was 0-1% vs 1-3%, respectively (24, 43-45). The rate of permanent hypoparathyroidism with TT compared with ST was 0-3.8% and 0-0.2%, respectively (24, 43, 44). The most important factor in the prevention of complications with thyroidectomy is the use of an appropriate surgical technique; the identification and conservation of the parathyroid and recurrent laryngeal nerve during surgery is considered the most valid method of avoiding more serious complications. Routine identification and conservation of these organs and their vascularization leads to a reduction of complications to the minimum (24). The study of Koyuncu et al. (24) did not show any permanent paralysis of the RLN in any of the 3 groups.

It is a common opinion that, despite the radical intent of surgeons, a real TT is rarely carried out. Remnants of thyroid tissue are often found and usually treated with radioiodine (RAI, 131I) is necessary for the complete ablation of the remaining thyroid tissue remnants (16, 47-49).

The literature on these tissue remnants is not very recent and is often based on techniques that are not very accurate in terms of determining the diameters of the tissue remaining (16, 47-49).

The first study in this area was in 1942 when Reinhardt employed autoradiography with 131I and observed thyroid tissue remnants in 7 of 12 rats that had undergone TT (16, 50). After this initial research, numerous clinical studies almost always demonstrated the presence of functioning thyroid tissue after TT; so much so that in certain centres, after ablative surgical treatment, therapy with radioiodine was carried out without a preliminary WBS (16, 50-52). The study of Salvatori et al. (16) showed that in 93.1% of TT, some residual thyroid tissue remains. In fact, these authors showed that only 6.9% of patients were clear of thyroid tissue after TT; 381 patients had residual thyroid tissue inside and 236 outside of the tumoural bed. The criteria defining the success of a thyroid ablation specify the complete removal of every visible functioning area in the thyroid gland, a 24-h 131I quantitative neck uptake (RAIU test) lower than 1% and a serum Tg off LT4 (serum Tg levels measured after L-T4 withdrawal; TSH > 30 µUI/ml) less than 2 ng/ml in the absence of Tg Ab. That study showed that many patients had thyroid remnants contralaterally of the affected lobe, demonstrating that attention is focused primarily of the diseased lobe in the case of unilateral pathology (16).

In the present study, we found significant levels of thyroid tissue remnants after TT in 34 cases of 102 (33.3%). Ultrasound evaluation of the neck showed 12 cases (11.7%), which should be re-classified as NTT (remnants < 1 cm), and 22 (21.6%) as ST (remnants ≥ 1 cm); thyroid remnants as large as 3 cm of parenchyma were observed (range 0.4-30 mm).

The 6.9% of effective TT found by Salvatori et al. (16) is not excessively low considering that the authors evaluated the presence or absence of thyroid remnants using the most accurate qualitative and quantitative diagnostic available and they established a strict cut-off value and highly specific criteria to define thyroid remnants. In particular, they scanned the neck using therapeutic doses of radioiodine; a very accurate diagnostic method to detect thyroid remnants due to the high photon stream and the consequent elevated thyroid remnant to the background radioactivity ratio (16, 53). This 6.9% of patients without thyroid remnants, which was considered high by the authors, could be explained by the fact that they decided to evaluate only patients operated on by surgeons expert in endocrinology (16).

Sosa et al. (54) demonstrated that the individual experience of the surgeon was significantly associated with the rate of post-thyroidectomy complications and the duration of postoperative hospitalization. He found a relationship between the experience of the surgeon and postoperative clinical progression in thyroid surgery. It is not surprising that the expertise of the surgeon can influence the percentage and the diameters of thyroid tissue remnants after TT (16).

In patients with thyroid tissue remnants, analysis of the distribution of 131I has shown that a significant number of functioning tissue foci situated at the extremity superior pole and in the pyramidal lobe, and these results could be explained by anatomical and pathophysiological reasons (16). Fratkin et al. (55) demonstrated that an area of difficulty for surgeons is Berry's ligament, a small, dense portion of the mid-posterior area of the thyroid capsule, which in any case is rather variable. This ligament links the thyroid tightly to the antero-lateral face of the trachea; the RLN runs inside this ligament for a few millimetres. Thus, in an attempt to avoid damaging this nerve, incomplete resection of the thyroid gland in this area may result in foci of 131I uptake in postoperative scans.

In conclusion, TT is the surgical intervention of choice in malignant thyreopathies and also in diffuse benign diseases affecting both lobes. It leads to a percentage of complications similar to NTT and ST, therefore, in our opinion, it represents the gold standard not only for malignant thyroid pathologies, but also for the majority of benign thyroid diseases. When carried out in specialized centres for thyroid surgery, the rate of complications is lower. However, the complete removal of all
the thyroid tissue employing TT is not the norm and micro/macroscopic remnants almost always remain (47, 48).

All patients undergoing TT, and not only those operated on for cancer of the thyroid, should be re-examined 6 months after the operation with a colour echodoppler of the thyroid lodge and reclassified on the basis of tissue remnants as follows:

A) Total Thyroidectomy (TT) = absence of macroscopic thyroid tissue remnants;
B) Near Total Thyroidectomy (NTT) = presence of thyroid tissue remnants < 1 cm;
C) Subtotal Thyroidectomy (ST) = presence of thyroid tissue remnants ≥ 1 cm.

References


ferred option. Medicina (Kaunas) 2008; 44:22-6.
ual function and recurrences in patients after partial thyroi-
65:543-6.
33. Berglund J, Bondesson L, Christensen SB, et al. Indications for
thyroxine therapy after surgery for nontoxic benign goitre. Ac-
34. Hedman I, Jansson S, Lindberg S. Need for thyroxine in patients
lobectomised for benign thyroid disease as assessed by follow-
up on average fifteen years after surgery. Acta Chir Scand 1986;
152:481-6.
35. Westermark K, Persson CP, Johansson H, Karlsson FA. Nodu-
lar goiter: effects of surgery and thyroxine medication. World J
36. Geerdsen JP, Hee P. Nontoxic goiter. II. A study of the pitui-
37. Vellar ID. Thomas Peel Dunhill: pioneer thyroid surgeon. Au-
38. Alsanea O, Clark OH. Treatment of Graves’ disease: the ad-
39. Müller PE, Bein B, Robens E, et al. Thyroid surgery according
to Enderlen-Hotz or Dunhill: a comparison of two surgical
86:112-6.
40. Perri S, Mariani G, Trunfio A, et al. Total thyroidectomy in the
surgical treatment of thyroid disease a retrospective clinical study.
41. Schlumberger M, Pacini F. Thyroid Tumors. Paris: Edition Nu-
cleon; 2003.
42. Pappalardo G, Guadalaxara A, Frattaroli FM, et al. Total com-
pared with subtotal thyroidectomy in benign nodular disease:
164:501-6.
43. Campana FP. Total thyroidectomy of goiter. G Chir 1997;
18:467-9.
44. Foster RS Jr. Morbidity and mortality after thyroidectomy. Surg
45. Perzik S. The place of total thyroidectomy in the management of
46. Wartofsky L, Sherman SI, Gopal J, et al. The use of radioactiv-
ide in patients with papillary and follicular thyroid can-
47. Huici D, Medvedec M, Dodic D, et al. Radioiodine uptake in
thyroid cancer patients after diagnostic application of low-do-
48. Leger FA, Izembart M, Dagousser F, et al. Decreased uptake of
therapeutic doses of iodine-131 after 185-MBq iodine-131 dia-
gnostic imaging for thyroid remnants in differentiated thyroid
49. Bajén MT, Mañé S, Muñoz A, García JR. Effect of a diagnostic
dose of 185 MBq 131I on postsurgical thyroid remnants. J Nu-
cl Med 2000; 41:2038-42.
50. Reinhardt WO. Method for determining completeness of thyroi-
50:81-4.
51. de Klerk JM, de Keizer B, Zelissen PM, et al. Fixed dosage of
131I for remnant ablation in patients with differentiated thy-
roid carcinoma without pre-ablative diagnostic 131I scintigraphy.
in administering 131I ablative therapy in patients with diffe-
rentiated thyroid carcinoma without a preablative diagnostic 131I
53. Sherman SI, Tielens ET, Sostre S, et al. Clinical utility of post-
treatment radioiodine scans in the management of patients with
54. Sosa JA, Bowman HM, Tielensch JM, et al. The importance of
surgeon experience for clinical and economic outcomes from thy-
55. Frankin MJ, Newsone HH Jr, Sharpe AR Jr, Tatsum JL. Cervi-
cal distribution of iodine 131 following total thyroidectomy for